
Health and Microfinance: Leveraging the Strengths of Two Sectors to Alleviate Poverty



freedom
from Hunger

Health and Microfinance: Leveraging the Strengths of Two Sectors to Alleviate Poverty

*Summary of Research Findings from Freedom from Hunger's Four-Year
Microfinance and Health Protection Initiative*

FREEDOM FROM HUNGER RESEARCH PAPER NO. 9

Marcia Metcalfe^a

Sheila Leatherman^b

Megan Gash^a

Bobbi Gray^a

Myka Reinsch Sinclair^a

Cassie Chandler^a

Christopher Dunford^a

^aFreedom from Hunger, 1644 Da Vinci Court, Davis, CA, 95618, USA

^bThe University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Gillings School of Global Public Health,
170 Rosenau Hall, CB #7400, 135 Dauer Drive, Chapel Hill, NC 27599-7400, USA

Copyright (c) 2011 Freedom from Hunger

Sections of this publication may be copied or adapted to meet local needs without permission from Freedom from Hunger, provided that the parts copied are distributed for free or at cost—not for profit. Please credit Freedom from Hunger and “Health and Microfinance: Leveraging the Strengths of Two Sectors to Alleviate Poverty,” for those sections excerpted.

For any commercial reproduction, please obtain permission from:

Freedom from Hunger
1644 DaVinci Court
Davis, California 95618
Tel.: 1-530-758-6200
info@freedomfromhunger.org

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	ii
Acronyms	iii
Summary	iv
1. Introduction	1
2. Methods	
2.1 Market Research	1
2.2 Design and Pilot-Testing of Health Intervention Packages	2
2.3 Evaluation	4
2.4 Limitations and Constraints	4
3. Findings	
3.1 Responsiveness to Client Needs	4
3.2 Changes in Health Knowledge and Behaviour	5
3.3 Changes in Access to and Use of Health Services	8
4. Discussion	11
References	13
List of Tables	
Table 1. Health Protection Interventions Developed by MFIs	2
Table 2. Responsiveness of Health Services and Products	4
Table 3. Changes in Health Knowledge and Behaviours	6
Table 4. Linkages to Health Services and Products and Financing	9

Acknowledgments

First and foremost, the authors of this paper thank all of the staff and clients from our microfinance institution (MFI) partners who devoted their time and expertise to develop, pilot and evaluate integrated health services at their MFIs: Bandhan, CARD (Center for Agriculture and Rural Development), CRECER (Crédito con Educación Rural), PADME (Projet d'Appui au Développement des Micro-Entreprises) and RCPB (Réseau des Caisses Populaires du Burkina). We also acknowledge many staff, interns and research assistants at Freedom from Hunger who assisted with the research and evaluation studies for the Microfinance and Health Protection initiative. Several research firms and collaborators contributed their expertise with research design and assisted with field data-collection and analysis: AC Nielson and GfK Mode Ltd. (India); CARD Research Unit (Philippines); PRIME and EMCON (Bolivia); Institute for Empirical Research in Political Economy (Bénin and Burkina Faso); Innovations for Poverty Action, John Brett (University of Colorado); and Benjamin Crookston (University of Utah School of Medicine). We also acknowledge and thank the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation for its support and funding of Freedom from Hunger's Microfinance and Health Protection initiative from 2006 through 2010.

September 2011

ACRONYMS:

CARD	Center for Agriculture and Rural Development, Inc.
CRECER	Crédito con Educación Rural
FGD	Focus-Group Discussion
LQAS	Lot Quality Assurance Sampling
MAHP	Microfinance and Health Protection
MFI	Microfinance Institution
ORS	Oral rehydration salts
PADME	Projet d'Appui au Développement des Micro-Entreprises
PRA	Participatory Rapid Appraisal
RCPB	Réseau des Caisses Populaires du Burkina
RCT	Randomized Control Trial

SUMMARY

Freedom from Hunger and five microfinance institutions (MFIs) from Bénin, Bolivia, Burkina Faso, India, and the Philippines tested whether MFIs could offer health-related services to deliver positive health and social impacts for clients while also being financially sustainable for the MFIs. The health services ranged from education, health-financing (loans, savings accounts and micro-insurance), to linkages to health providers and the sale of health products in rural communities. Research methodologies—both quantitative and qualitative— included client interviews, focus-group discussions, a randomized control trial and cost-benefit analyses at the institutional level. The results suggest positive benefits associated with discrete health-related interventions at the individual client and household levels, including increased health knowledge with some behavioural change, reduced financial barriers to health care and improvements in access to health services and products provided by private and public providers. The findings add support for advancing a cross-sectoral and integrated approach of community health interventions with microfinance services, as part of a broader and scalable strategy to address poverty while extending health knowledge and information, health-care financing, and essential health-care services to many millions of poor families.

I. INTRODUCTION

MFIs reach more than 155 million households,¹ providing credit and other financial services to help the poor start and grow small businesses, build productive assets, and better cope with financial shocks. Although access to financial services is undeniably important to poor families, it is insufficient on its own to address the multi-dimensional challenges of poverty. Ill health and the inability to access health care are key factors both leading to and resulting from poverty,² and the financial and time costs of illness and seeking treatment represent a large burden on households.^{3, 4} MFI clients and staff report that the cost of illness causes difficulties with loan repayment and savings deposits, often requiring clients to use their business loans and other household assets to pay for health-care expenses. Clients report low utilization of health services and delays in seeking care, citing barriers of cost, geographic access, cultural beliefs, lack of trust in providers, and inadequate information about how to prevent and treat illness.

MFIs are well positioned to play a cross-sectoral role in reaching the poor with a range of simple but important health services. MFIs have long-term, trusting relationships with clients, mostly women, and bring them together regularly over months and years to repay loans and deposit savings. These group meetings can also provide established distribution points for health-related information, products, and services. In 2006, Freedom from Hunger launched the Microfinance and Health Protection (MAHP) initiative to test the feasibility and impact of adding health interventions to financial services with MFIs in Bénin (Projet d'Appui au Développement des Micro-Entreprises—PADME), Bolivia (Crédito con Educación Rural—CRECER), Burkina Faso (Réseau des Caisses Populaires du Burkina—RCPB), India (Bandhan) and the Philippines (Center for Agriculture and Rural Development—CARD). This paper reports results of this initiative in terms of health-related impacts for clients, their families and, in some cases, their communities.

2. METHODS

2.1 Market Research

Market research at each MFI generated data regarding the perceived needs of clients and families and the availability and current patterns of use of local health resources. Data were collected using Participatory Rapid Appraisal (PRA) tools and focus-group discussions with clients, MFI staff, and local health providers. Secondary sources, such as available epidemiological data, were consulted.⁵ The results confirmed a significant burden of ill health and provided a detailed understanding of health access issues and coping strategies of the MFI clients. Overall, the research showed that the clients wanted and needed both health services and financing products that would work together to improve access to preventive and routine care, while also protecting from the financial shock of more serious illnesses.

Three main barriers to health emerged to provide the conceptual framework for the design and implementation of health-related interventions.

- Insufficient knowledge and information about health risks, health-related behaviours, and appropriate use of health services
- Inadequate access to effective and appropriate health services and products
- Inability to afford necessary health services

2.2 Design and Pilot-Testing of Health Intervention Packages

Context-specific packages of health services and products were developed at each MFI and introduced in 2007 as outlined in Table 1.

TABLE 1. HEALTH PROTECTION INTERVENTIONS DEVELOPED BY MFIS

MFI (Country)			
Total Number of Clients Health Program Outreach as of December 2009	Health Knowledge and Information	Access to Health Services and Products	Health Financing
<p>Bandhan (India)</p> <p>Total Clients: 1.9 Million</p> <p>Health Program Outreach: 51,900</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health education provided in community ▪ Education reinforced by individual visits from trained community volunteers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health products (e.g., oral rehydration salts [ORS], oral contraceptives, antacids, etc.) sold and delivered locally by community health volunteers ▪ Referrals to local providers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health loans
<p>CARD MRI (Philippines)</p> <p>Total Clients: 991,474</p> <p>Health Program Outreach: 152,424</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health education at credit meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Discount network of private health providers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Enrolment in national health insurance program with loans to finance premium payments
<p>CRECER (Bolivia)</p> <p>Total Clients: 102,212</p> <p>Health Program Outreach: 26,296</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health education at credit meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mobile services provided through “health days” in local communities ▪ Referrals to health providers ▪ Contract for discounted service from private health providers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health loans
<p>PADME (Bénin)</p> <p>Total Clients: 48,962</p> <p>Health Program Outreach: 11,290</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health education at credit group meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Distribution of insecticide-treated mosquito nets (1,000 nets distributed) 	
<p>RCPB (Burkina Faso)</p> <p>Total Clients: 671,909</p> <p>Health Program Outreach: 59,746</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health education at credit group meetings 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Health savings ▪ Health loans

2.3 Evaluation

Quantitative and qualitative data were collected from client interviews (some with baseline and endline analyses), focus-group discussions, interviews with staff and health-care providers, and regularly reported MFI financial indicators. At PADME (Bénin), a randomized control trial (RCT) examined the impacts of health education in all-female and mixed-gender groups. Since it was not possible to measure health outcomes of the interventions within the available time and resources, the evaluation of benefits to clients was organized around the following key process dimensions of health:

- **Responsiveness.** The extent to which programs addressed client need and demand.
- **Change in Knowledge and Behaviour.** Changes in client knowledge and health behaviours that would be expected to affect prevention and management of common diseases and planning for illness.
- **Improvements in Access and Use of Services and Products.** Impact on client ability to access needed health services, including increased geographic access and affordability.

The research and evaluation studies were carried out over a two-year period, after program start-up. Detailed descriptions of research methods and the complete findings from studies at each MFI are available for reference.⁶ While not every indicator in each study showed significant change, many did, and some of the more significant changes across the dimensions of interest are presented in the tables below. Mixed results or negative findings were limited; primarily in areas of hand-washing (India), management of childhood diseases (Bénin), and some behaviours related to malaria and HIV/AIDS (Bénin). Our intention is to influence policy and practice in this emerging field of integrating microfinancing with community health interventions; therefore, we are presenting the findings that can guide programming in the future.

2.4 Limitations and Constraints

Several aspects of the design and implementation of the health interventions proved challenging to the evaluation process:

- Rapid expansion of the health programs—in some cases more than 10 times as many participants as originally anticipated—changed the number, geographic location, and diversity of target populations reached and made it difficult to compare indicator measures before and after the health protection interventions were introduced, and between intervention and non-intervention areas.
- With the exception of the education at RCT at PADME, the health interventions were not randomly assigned, precluding the ability to establish causality between the provision of the health services and subsequent client knowledge and behaviour change.
- All client data were self-reported with risk of subjective bias and may not accurately represent actual behaviours.
- In the case of PADME (Bénin), changes in MFI leadership led to service interruptions that may have impacted how the health program was implemented across the treatment and control areas.

These limitations were anticipated and addressed by the use of a multiplicity of mixed methods, enabling the comparison of findings using more than one study and approach. This is particularly important given the reliance on self-reported data. In some cases, quantitative data show only small, though statistically significant impact. Yet these same indications of positive impact are echoed and even amplified in qualitative studies. While the triangulation of results and findings are not conclusive, it provides additional support for the conclusion that there was movement in the direction of positive impact across the studied health dimensions.

3.0 FINDINGS

3.1 Responsiveness to client needs

The assessment of client responsiveness was based on client satisfaction, recommendation of services to others, and intent to repeat use. Qualitative data were collected through client focus groups and interviews and are summarized in Table 2.

Across all programs, clients reported high levels of satisfaction with the availability and features of the health interventions, indicating they would recommend the services to others. Health loans, savings and insurance were reported as meeting client needs for safe, secure and affordable sources of funds to finance health-care expenses; the intent to repeat use of health loans was widely reported. Clients at RCPB and CRECER repeatedly reported that they valued access to health loans through their MFI over seeking funding from family and friends with the accompanying uncertainty and perceived loss of dignity. At CARD, the only MFI to experiment with health micro-insurance, 87% of enrolled clients continued their insurance after two years.

TABLE 2. RESPONSIVENESS OF HEALTH SERVICES AND PRODUCTS

MFI	Findings
Bandhan (India)	<p>Health Education: 100% of focus-group participants reported that they</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ were satisfied with education and had gained new knowledge ▪ would recommend to others <p>Health Loans</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 84% of clients were relieved they could access health loans ▪ 98% would recommend the loan to others, and 80% would take out the loan again <p>Health Products</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 90% of groups were satisfied with product availability from community health volunteers (ORS, oral contraceptives, antacids, etc.)
CARD (Philippines)	<p>Health Micro-insurance (with premium loans)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 94%–98% of clients indicated the insurance was affordable ▪ 100% of clients in focus groups would recommend to others
CRECER (Bolivia)	<p>Health Education and Mobile Health Days</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 82% of clients were satisfied with the number of education sessions ▪ 76% were satisfied with content ▪ 83% of participants felt comfortable with care received at health fairs <p>Health Loans</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Clients expressed high satisfaction with availability of health loans (77%), interest rates (80%), and size of loan (88%) ▪ 100% of clients who had used a health loan would do so again

MFI	Findings
PADME (Bénin)	Health Education and Distribution of Nets <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Availability of mosquito nets and health education was important factor in overall client satisfaction with the MFI's credit program
RCPB (Burkina Faso)	Health Loans and Savings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ High level of satisfaction with access to health loans (100%) and health savings (71%)

3.2 Changes in Health Knowledge and Behaviour

In each MFI, clients received health education designed to improve both knowledge and behaviour for the prevention and management of illness.

New education modules were developed and delivered focusing on financial planning for health and rational use of available health services. The MFIs also extended previously designed educational modules on prevention and management of malaria, HIV/AIDS prevention and integrated management of childhood illness.

Four of the MFIs delivered the education through their credit officers and as part of regularly scheduled credit-group meetings. In India, Bandhan adapted a model from BRAC (Bangladesh), in which separate staff were hired and trained to deliver education in monthly health forums for entire communities. This education was reinforced during home visits by trained community volunteers who also sold a range of health products, including oral rehydration salts, oral contraceptives, antacids, analgesics, antiseptic solutions, bandages and sanitary napkins. Table 3 summarizes examples of knowledge and behaviour changes across three of the implementing MFIs.

TABLE 3. CHANGES IN HEALTH KNOWLEDGE AND BEHAVIOURS

MFI and Education Topics	Findings	Method
<p>Bandhan (India)</p> <p>Care of newborns, feeding of babies and treatment of child diarrhoea</p>	<p>Health Knowledge</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase of 17 percentage points (from 75% to 92%) in clients who knew about exclusive breastfeeding for six months* (n₁=240; n₂ = 62) ▪ Increase of 24 percentage points (from 54% to 77%) in number of clients who knew to dry and wrap newborns* (n₁=151; n₂=60) 	<p>Baseline (n₁) and follow-up (n₂) studies administered about one year apart to clients in villages with health program</p>
<p>Bandhan (India)</p>	<p>Increase of 27 percentage points (from 71% to 98%) in number of clients who knew how soon after birth an infant should be breastfed* (n₁=260; n₂=62)</p> <p>Health Behaviours</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase of 35 percentage points (from 61% to 96%) in women in sample who had or were caring for child 12 months of age or younger who reported breastfeeding child within one hour of birth* (n₁=98; n₂=57) ▪ Increase of 16 percentage points (from 39% to 55%) in women in sample reporting they had introduced complementary foods into a child's diet at age six months or older* (n₁=106; n₂=48) ▪ Increase of 28 percentage points (from 60% to 88%) in women in sample with a child who had diarrhoea in the last 10 months who reported treating the child with ORS* (n₁=10; n₂=42) 	
<p>CARD (Philippines)</p> <p>Planning and saving ahead for illness</p>	<p>Health Savings Behaviours</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 15% increase in women who reported talking to a family member about saving money for future medical needs ▪ Increase of 13 percentage points (79% to 92%) in women who reported were saving to prepare for a future illness or medical emergency* 	<p>Client surveys before and after education using Lot Quality Assurance Sampling (LQAS) methodology (n=90)</p>

MFI and Education Topics	Findings	Method
<p>PADME (Bénin)</p> <p>Malaria prevention education and distribution of insecticide-treated bed nets.</p>	<p>Malaria Prevention Knowledge</p> <p>Knowledge that mosquito nets and insecticide-treated nets could prevent malaria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Difference of +6 percentage points for mixed groups (men and women) with education (n=807) compared to mixed groups without education (n=899)* <p>Knowledge that pregnant women and children under age five are at high risk for malaria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Difference of +8 percentage points for all groups with education (n=1,766) compared to groups without education (n=1,859)* <p>Malaria Prevention Behaviours</p> <p>Use of mosquito repellent or insecticide in past two weeks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Difference of +9 percentage points for households in groups with education, compared to groups without education* ▪ Difference of +14 percentage points for mixed groups with education, compared to mixed groups without education* <p>Households that had an insecticide-treated net in good repair in the house:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Difference of +16 percentage points for mixed groups with education compared to mixed groups without education* 	<p>Randomized control trial (RCT) evaluation in 138 villages in which credit was provided to all-female groups and mixed (male and female) groups. Half of each type of group received education and credit, and the other groups received only credit</p>
<p>HIV/AIDS prevention education</p>	<p>HIV/AIDS Prevention Knowledge</p> <p>Knew that AIDS is not transmitted by mosquitoes, sharing food or supernatural means:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Average difference of +6 percentage points for all groups with education (n=1,766) compared to groups without education (n=1,859)* <p>Knew where to get a condom:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Difference of +6 percentage points for all groups with education compared to groups without education* 	

* Statistically significant at $p \leq 0.05$.

In India, where the education was targeted at maternal and infant health and hand-washing, we observed significant improvement of knowledge about maternal health, care of newborns, child-feeding, and management of diarrhoea, but not for hand-washing.

In the Philippines, where CARD's education emphasized the risks and costs of illnesses, the need to save money to prepare for health needs, and use of CARD's discounted provider network, women reported saving more money for health-related expenses. At PADME (Bénin), credit with and without education on HIV/AIDS and malaria were randomly assigned to groups in different villages with a total of four different interventions: all-female groups with credit only; all-female groups with credit and education; mixed-gender groups with credit only; and mixed-gender groups with credit and education. The results indicate that villages receiving health education performed better than credit-only villages in knowledge gain and behaviour change. However, no significant differences were found in certain indicators of important behaviour change: use of mosquito nets, numbers sleeping under nets or numbers with treated nets in the home, reported use of a condom during last sexual intercourse, or women having talked to their husbands about AIDS. Out of the four interventions, the mixed-gender groups with education performed better in knowledge and behaviour change than all-women groups with education. This unexpected result is perhaps understandable in the context of rural Béninois culture in which women often rely on the financial and nonfinancial support or permission from men in their lives in order to make key decisions or implement changes.

It is of interest that the positive differences in health knowledge and behaviours at PADME were detected in samples of the general population in villages where credit groups received education, and not just among PADME clients. This suggests impact beyond the firsthand participants in the credit and health education program. A similar spill-over effect was observed at Bandhan, where clients reported much higher and statistically significant levels of providing advice to others on breastfeeding, ante- and neonatal care and treating respiratory illness and diarrhoea following the introduction of the health education program than before.

3.3 Changes in Access to and Use of Health Services

A major need of MFI clients was to have more reliable access to health services with respect to both geographic access and affordability. A range of mechanisms was developed to link or extend access for clients to local health services and products, in lieu of the MFI developing and providing health services directly. These included the training and supervision of community health promoters and health product distributors, discounted referral arrangements with private providers, and mobile health "fairs" with diagnostic and preventive services.

Four of the MFIs included financial products, as requested by clients, to pay for and manage the costs of illness and accidents. MFIs in India, Bolivia and Burkina Faso developed individual health loans with lower interest rates than the microenterprise loans and with more flexible repayment terms. A health savings product at RCPB (Burkina Faso) enables clients to establish savings accounts designated solely to pay health expenses. The Filipino MFI (CARD) enrolls clients in PhilHealth (the government-sponsored health insurance program) on a voluntary basis, provides loans to pay the annual premium, and remits the premium payments to PhilHealth.

Table 4 summarizes findings from the various interventions to increase geographic and financial accessibility.

TABLE 4: LINKAGES TO HEALTH SERVICES AND PRODUCTS AND FINANCING

MFI and Intervention	Findings	Method
<p>Bandhan (India)</p> <p>Health loans, community health workers, health product sales</p>	<p>ACCESS/USE OF SERVICES</p> <p>Women who had received active advice and/or referrals from community health volunteers for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Children with diarrhoea in the past three months (81%, n=52) ▪ Children with acute respiratory problems in the past two weeks (80%, n=180) ▪ Neonatal care (77%, n=81) <p>40% of new mothers (n=78) were visited by a community health worker within 48 hours of birth</p> <p>41% of respondents had purchased ORS from the village health volunteers (n=180)</p> <p>FINANCING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 62% felt able to afford other necessities as a result of loan availability ▪ 33% indicated that without a loan, they would have delayed treatment 	<p>Client interviews conducted as part of follow-up study one year after implementation of interventions</p> <p>Individual in-depth interviews with health loan users (n=65)</p>
<p>CARD (Philippines)</p> <p>Health micro-insurance, with loans to pay premium; discounted network of health providers</p>	<p>ACCESS/USE OF SERVICES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 9% of clients reported use of a network-preferred provider ▪ 100% indicated a positive experience with accessing a network provider and would recommend to others <p>FINANCING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 88% of clients with insurance reported that the insurance “helped a lot” ▪ 97% indicated that this insurance gave them protection from health emergencies ▪ 35% indicated that the insurance covered more than one-half of their total medical expenses and 58% that it covered half or less 	<p>In-depth client interviews conducted one-and-a-half years post-introduction of intervention</p> <p>In-depth interviews of randomly selected clients who had enrolled in the insurance (n=40)</p>

MFI and Intervention	Findings	Method
<p>CRECER (Bolivia)</p> <p>Health loans, mobile health days</p>	<p>ACCESS/USE OF SERVICES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Clients seeking preventive care for themselves increased by 5.2 percentage points (9.4% to 14.6%, p=.07) ▪ Clients seeking preventive services for themselves and additional family members increased 8.3 percentage points (from 1.5% to 9.8%)* ▪ 24% of mobile health day users reported never having visited a medical provider before <p>FINANCING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Recipients reported reduced use of microenterprise loans for health purposes ▪ Clients with health loans and with access to health loans reported less frequently that costs prevented them from seeking medical treatment in the past year 	<p>Baseline (n=240) and endline (n=247) studies conducted one year apart</p> <p>Interviews of randomly selected clients who had participated in a “health day” (n=41)</p> <p>Interviews of randomly selected clients who 1) had access to and used health loans (n=41); 2) had access to but did not use a health loan (n=27); 3) had no access to health loans (n=21)</p>
<p>RCPB (Burkina Faso)</p> <p>Health savings, health loans</p>	<p>ACCESS/USE OF SERVICES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Clients in the intervention area reported higher use of preventive care (24% compared to 9% in non-intervention area)* <p>FINANCING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Clients in the intervention area were 2.6 times more likely to feel somewhat or very satisfied with their preparations to meet future health expenses* ▪ Clients in the intervention area were 3.7 times more likely to feel somewhat to very confident that they would be able to save for future health-care expenses* 	<p>Interviews with randomly selected clients with access to health savings and health loans (n=96) and of clients without these products (n=96)</p>

* Statistically significant at $p \leq 0.05$.

Overall, the findings suggest that the interventions creating linkages between MFI clients and health providers resulted in several benefits: services were more geographically accessible, choice of providers was increased (especially private providers), and affordability was improved through negotiated discounts of fees. The findings are insufficient to predict how much such health programs will increase appropriate use of services by MFI clients. For example, although a large percentage of women in India reported receiving referrals from the trained community health volunteers and many thousands of CARD clients in the Philippines have access to a discounted provider network, data that accurately tracked and measured the number who actually sought care during the study period was not collected. The finding at CRECER that 24% of health fair attendees had never previously seen a medical provider, along with clients at CRECER and RCPB who reported higher use of preventive services in the intervention area as compared to areas where clients had less access to services, suggests that the health interventions will support greater access and use over time.

Health loans, savings and insurance are perceived by clients as having improved their ability to access care and manage larger health-care expenses while also enabling them to maintain some privacy regarding their health needs. At CARD, the only MFI to experiment with health micro-insurance, the unusually high level of re-enrolment is an additional indicator of strong client valuation of this financial product.

Importantly, findings suggest that health loans enabled clients to reduce waiting times or gain access to treatment that they might not have otherwise. In addition to client reports from CRECER that suggest the cost of care may be less of a barrier for health-loan users than non-loan users, clients also reported that without the health loans, they would have resorted to borrowing from family members (53.8%), selling personal belongings (24.4%) or taking a loan from another institution (14.6%), and 12.2% would not have sought care at all. Similar findings from India indicate that one-third of health-loan clients would have delayed or not received recommended treatment. At RCPB, clients with access to health savings and loans indicated they were able to seek treatment more quickly and reported greater use of preventive services.

However, not all financial worries were eliminated. Health-loan sizes are limited, and clients at Bandhan and CRECER reported that the loans often did not cover all health expenses, sometimes leaving members with a need to borrow from other sources. Health insurance for CARD members provides coverage of many hospital expenses, yet 58 percent of interviewed clients who had used the insurance reported that it covered one-half or less of their total costs of care, with the difference made up from savings and borrowing from families or friends.

4.0 DISCUSSION

In terms of health education, our results are consistent with those from other research in which the combination of health education and microfinance services was associated with significant improvements in client health knowledge and practice.⁷ Examples include: treatment of diarrhoeal illness in the Dominican Republic⁸; breastfeeding, and management of diarrhoea in Ghana and Bolivia with resulting behaviour changes (producing significant height and weight-for-age improvements for children of participants)⁹; and knowledge of malaria prevention and treatment (including purchase and use of mosquito nets) in Ghana.¹⁰ Together, these findings indicate that the impact of health education can be both significant and realized within relatively short periods of time.

The use of health loans and health savings as part of the array of financial instruments available to the poor to weather the impact of illness has not been widely tested and reported in the literature. Year-long financial diaries from hundreds of poor families in India, Bangladesh and South Africa¹¹ revealed how irregular and uncertain incomes challenge the poor to meet basic household-consumption needs, including health care. The average poor household used 8–10 different types of financial instruments, both formal and informal. While they continued to use informal sources (loans from families, moneylenders, savings groups, etc.), they strongly valued the reliability of the formal instruments available from MFIs. This is consistent with our findings that clients valued health loans, health savings and health insurance as one of several important sources of health financing available to cope with health expenses.

The experience of CARD with micro-insurance, as a product for financing and risk management of illness, is also consistent with conclusions from other studies.¹² MFIs have the capacity to utilize existing low-cost delivery channels to enrol poor families and collect premiums, and to provide financing so that annual premiums can be paid over time in small, regular payments. MFI client education can be targeted toward insurance literacy and toward goals of reducing the incidence and cost impact of common diseases. Additional research is needed to look at the impact of these and other interventions on both health and financial security of poor families over longer time periods. The MFI-negotiated provider contracts and referral arrangements, the use of community-health volunteers to provide advice and encourage clients to seek preventive and sick care, and mobile health fairs that bring providers directly to remote areas, helped mitigate some of the barriers to care faced by the rural poor. Providers demonstrated willingness and enthusiasm for forging relationships with the MFIs to reach greater numbers and at price points that enabled more clients to afford and access care. Private- and public-health providers in Bolivia, India and the Philippines quickly recognized the opportunity afforded by the MFIs to help them to efficiently extend their services to otherwise difficult or unreachable families and increase their market share.

Beyond the benefits observed for MFI clients, the provider linkages also appear to yield community-level benefits. At Bandhan, the health educators and village-level health volunteers have forged informal relationships with public-health providers and informal providers, meeting with them and inviting their attendance to community health forums to help improve accuracy and consistency of health information and to coordinate efforts in support of improved health practices. As an example, Bandhan's health volunteers work with the public-health service as extenders of local health campaigns, such as oral polio vaccine distribution. CRECER's regular health fairs are open to relatives and friends of clients, and are periodically organized as multi-day, community-wide events with health education, screening and diagnostic services available for very low or no cost. CARD's provider network that offers expanded choice and reduced costs for clients and their families is also intended to help retain health providers in the locale. Health providers of all types are in short supply in the Philippines and especially in rural areas, yet CARD has successfully recruited and retained a growing network of providers, who cite benefits that include increased number of patient visits and professional satisfaction from the opportunity to reach more of the underserved.

In conclusion, we find that MFIs offer large and growing distribution networks that can provide services to improve both health and financial security with value accruing to multiple stakeholders. Relatively modest investments to support integration of health and financial services can yield substantial financial and nonfinancial benefits for the MFIs, their clients, and the communities in which they work. Other research from in-depth cost and benefit studies conducted during this initiative presents evidence that the health protection options are practical and low-cost for MFIs to provide, and that they provide competitive advantages by attracting and retaining clients.¹³ As evidence of the MFIs' ability to sustain and extend such services, by mid-2010, all of the MFI partners were actively expanding their health programs to reach greater numbers of clients.

Linkages with MFIs offer health-care providers and micro-insurers feasible, low-cost delivery channels to reach remote areas and populations with simple yet effective health services and products.

REFERENCES

- ¹ Daley-Harris S. *State of the Microcredit Summit Campaign Report 2009*. 2009. Washington, D.C.; As of December 31, 2007; 3,552 microcredit institutions reported reaching 154,825,825 clients.
- ² Narayan D, Patesch P, editors. *Voices of the Poor: From Many Lands*. Washington: World Bank; 2000.
- ³ McIntyre D, Thiede M, Dahlgren G, Whitehead M. "What are the economic consequences for households of illness and of paying for health care in low- and middle-income country contexts?" *Social Science & Medicine*. 2006;62:858-65.
- ⁴ Russell S. "The economic burden of illness for households in developing countries: a review of studies focusing on malaria, tuberculosis, and human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome." *Am J Trop Med Hyg*. 2004; 71 (Suppl 2): 147-55.
- ⁵ Metcalfe M, Reinsch M. "Enhancing the impact of microfinance: client demand for health protection services on three continents." 2008. Unpublished manuscript (<http://www.ffhtechnical.org/resources/microfinance-health>).
- ⁶ Microfinance and Health Protection Initiative—Research reports (<http://www.ffhtechnical.org/resources/microfinance-health>)
- ⁷ Leatherman S, Metcalfe M, Geissler K, Dunford C. "Integrating microfinance and health strategies: examining the evidence to inform policy and practice." In press, *Health Policy and Planning*, 2011.
- ⁸ Dohn AL, Chavez A, Doshn M, Saturria L, Pimental C. "Changes in health indicators related to health promotion and microcredit programs in the Dominican Republic." *Rev Panam Salud Publica*. 2004 Mar, 15(3): 185–93
- ⁹ Dunford C. "Building better lives: sustainable integration of microfinance with education in health, family planning, and HIV/AIDS prevention for the poorest entrepreneurs." *Pathways Out of Poverty*. Sam Daley-Harris, ed. Bloomfield, CT: Kumarian Press, Inc; 2002; p 75–131.
- ¹⁰ De La Cruz N, Crookston B, Gray B, Alder S, Dearden K. "Microfinance against malaria: impact of Freedom from Hunger's malaria education when delivered by rural banks in Ghana." *Transactions of the Royal Society of Trop Med & Hyg*. 2009; 103(12):1229–36.
- ¹¹ Collins D, Morduch J, Rutherford S, Rutheven O. *Portfolios of the Poor: How the World's Poor Live on \$2 a Day*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. 2009.
- ¹² Dror D, Radermacher R, Khadilkar S, Schout P, Hay F, Singh A, et al. "Microinsurance: innovations in low-cost health insurance." *Health Affairs*, 2009; 28 (6): 1788–98.
- ¹³ Reinsch, M, Dunford C, Metcalfe M. "Costs and benefits to microfinance institutions offering health protection services to clients." *Enterprise Development and Microfinance*, 2001, 22(3); pp 241-258.